

**Task Force on Plea Bargaining, Sentencing, and Dispositions**  
**State Courts Building, Phoenix**  
**Meeting Minutes: December 10, 2021**

---

**Members Present:**

Melissa Acosta	Jason Kalish	Rosemarie Lynch
Hon Krista Carman (Zoom)	Lawrence Koplow	Hon Frankie Jones
Domingo Corona (Zoom)	Andrew LeFevre	Xochitl Orozco
Hon David Cunanan	Steven Lessard (Zoom)	Sheila Polk
Sandra Diehl (Zoom)	Hon Danelle Liwski (Zoom)	Hon Antonio Riojas (Zoom)
Will Gonzalez (Zoom)	Hon Justice Lopez (Chairperson)	Hon Valerie Wyant (Zoom)
Elizabeth Ortiz	Jon Smith	

**Members Absent:**

**AOC Staff:**

Shanda Breed  
Edward Gilligan  
Carissa Moore

**Guest:**

Herb Garcia, Attorney Supervisor Maricopa  
County Office of Public Defense Services  
Maribeth Hoyle, AOC  
Kristie Wooley, AOC

**Members of the Public:**

None

- 
- **Call to Order, Welcome, Introductions, and Opening Remarks** - Justice John Lopez called the meeting to order at 10:03am.
  - **Data Collection – Speakers, Presentations, and Discussion**
    - Jason Kalish – gave an overview of prosecutor by Carpel. Demographics are populated by the police and some information from the Court (including dates and the clerk updating information during the hearing will be updated in real time). Usually, the attorney disposes the case and enters information. Bond amount during IA is shown. Original charges do not show, only the final charge.
    - Data dashboard – interactive – can drill down to offense types/lead charge, year, etc.
    - Law enforcement only requires race; ethnicity is not captured.
    - Sheila Polk – gave an overview of the Data Dashboard for Yavapai County. Race & Ethnicity is not broken down. In 2018, Yavapai County Attorney’s office received \$100K from the legislature and it took 9 months to set up the dashboards. Pinal County Attorney’s office also received \$100K.

- Andrew LeFevre – presented on HB 2166 – ACJC has the desire to create a roadmap that will be useful for the State.
  - Bert Cisneros – AOC creates summary reports. 13 counties on the AJACS system; Maricopa & Pima have separate databases but provide information to the AOC for the summary reports.
  - Valerie Wyant – no information is used from the PSA to enter in AJACS.
  - Ed Gilligan – PSA is a new tool. Every jurisdiction does not use the PSA 100% of the time; depends on local jurisdiction processes. The PSA is in the process of being automated.
  - Speaker - Retired Hon Robbin Stuckert
  - Speaker – Professor Megan Stevenson
- **Discussion** – possible action regarding specific recommendations to compile and publish demographic data on plea bargains, sentencing, and disposition.
    - How to make a recommendation? This is an opportunity to offer insight into the data collection that needs to occur to weed out disparities.
    - How to map? Include data points. Identify structural differences that inherently increase crime rates.
    - Partner with ASU to survey defendants?
    - Survey – random sample – longstanding system recommendation. Present data from the individuals who went through the system about their experience.
    - Come up with who/what are similarly situated variables.
    - Don't focus on racial bias but the potential for racial disparity.
    - What are those questions we want answers to? Work backward to ensure the data is captured to answer.
    - How to draft the report?
      - a. Open a draft report \*create draft based on AO and put into SharePoint.\*
      - b. Identify the chain of events. Arrest, pretrial, etc. and make recommendations for measuring disparities during each event.
    - Schedule additional meeting before February – invite law enforcement – DPS. Municipal, Sheriff to define how race & ethnicity is collected on police reports.
  - **Call to the Public**  
No public comment was received.
  - **Adjournment**  
The meeting adjourned at

**Next Meeting:** State Courts Building, February 11, 2022.

*\*Note: an audio recording of this meeting is available upon request. \**